Economic performance and the demand for foreign labor in the oil-exporting and laborimporting states of the Arab Gulf

Case of Oman

Central Bank of Oman and Sultan Qaboos University

3rd Annual Conference of the Regional Research Network of the Central Bank of MENA 14-15 Sep 2023



Motivations

B

Presence of foreign labor: Economic, social, and political implications

The impact differs: status of the economy, national employment, and local social conditions

Special importance to the GCC:

- Foreign labor accounts for a significant proportion of the workforce.
- Increasing demand for foreign labor: Preference for expatriates, the lack of necessary skills among locals, the lower salaries offered to locals compared to expatriates.
- Economic growth is labor dependent, key factor in economic development.

Motivations

ί

Creates social and economic challenges:

- Social cohesion and social inequality issues
- Loss of national identity and culture in the long run
- Job insecurity for locals
- Reluctance of locals to take up certain types of jobs: physically demanding or have low salaries
- Relatively high unemployment rate of nationals (serious concern)
- **Bahrain and Oman**: the strongest pressure to nationalize private sector labor markets
- **Economic reforms**: Diversification, improving productivity, fostering the emergence of the private sector, and ensuring that labor market policies support the employment of nationals.
 - The relationship between economic performance and the demand for foreign labor in the Arab Gulf region is a complex issue.

Percentage of expatriates in GCC countries Year: 2022

Country	Expats as a percentage of the total population
United Arab Emirates	88.50%
Qatar	85.70%
Kuwait	69.20%
Bahrain	52.00%
Oman	44.00%
Saudi Arabia	32.70%

Source: https://www.go-gulf.ae/expatriate-middle-east/



Change in Number of Expats in Oman 2009-2020 0.9 0.8 0.7 0.6 0.5 Millions 0.4 0.3 0.2 0.1 0 2013 2014 2016 2017 2010 2011 2009 2012 2015 2018 2019 2020 -Specialist **—**Technical **Occupational Labourer Skilled Labourer** -Limited Skill Labourer

The relationship between economic growth and the total expatriate labor has yet to be directly examined in the literature. (Aggregated & Disaggregated levels)

Contributions



Two recent policy debates in Oman, the GCC countries:

- Increased foreign labor force and expats' role in economic growth.
- High rate of unemployment of nationals.

This estimation will guide analyzing and forecasting the foreign labor dynamic, total output, and impact of policies.

Main Objectives

 Investigates the relationship between economic growth and demand for labor in Oman, considering separately skilled and unskilled labor as well as hydrocarbon GDP and nonhydrocarbon GDP.

• Examine the causality relationship among the variables.



LITERATURE REVIEW



Large literature on the relationship between labor and different macroeconomic indicators; few studies on the relationships between growth rate and employment.



Previous studies have not directly examined the association between the demand for expatriates and the overall economic performance in the GCC, nor consider disaggregation.



The question of whether economic expansion derives the foreign workers or vice versa has been left unanswered.



Model Specification and Data



Model Specification and Data

- $LGDP_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 LEXPAT_t + \beta_2 LGEXP_t + \beta_3 GREV_t + \varepsilon_{1t}$ (1a)
- $LHGDP_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 LEXPAT_t + \beta_2 LGEXP_t + \beta_3 GREV_t + \varepsilon_{2t}$ (2a)
- $LNHGDP_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 LEXPAT_t + \beta_2 LGEXP_t + \beta_3 GREV_t + \varepsilon_{3t}$ (3a)
- $LGDP_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 LSEXPAT_t + \beta_2 LGEXP_t + \beta_3 GREV_t + \varepsilon_{1t}$ (1b)
- $LHGDP_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 LSEXPAT_t + \beta_2 LGEXP_t + \beta_3 GREV_t + \varepsilon_{2t}$ (2b)
- $LNHGDP_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 LSEXPAT_t + \beta_2 LGEXP_t + \beta_3 GREV_t + \varepsilon_{3t}$ (3b)
- $LGDP_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 LUSEXPAT_t + \beta_2 LGEXP_t + \beta_3 GREV_t + \varepsilon_{1t}$ (1c)
- $LHGDP_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 LUSEXPAT_t + \beta_2 LGEXP_t + \beta_3 GREV_t + \varepsilon_{2t}$ (2c)

(3c)

• $LNHGDP_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 LUSEXPAT_t + \beta_2 LGEXP_t + \beta_3 GREV_t + \varepsilon_{3t}$

Model Specification and Data

- $\Delta LGDP_t = C_1 + \sum_{i_1=1}^{l_1} \tau_{1_i} \Delta LGDP_{t-i_1} + \sum_{i_2=1}^{l_2} \alpha_{1_i} \Delta LEXPAT_{t-i_1} + \sum_{i_3=1}^{l_3} \alpha_{2_i} \Delta LGEXP_{t-i_2} + \sum_{i_4=1}^{l_4} \alpha_{3_i} \Delta LGREV_{t-i_3} + \beta_1 LEXPAT_{t-j} + \beta_2 LGEXP_{t-j} + \beta_3 LGREV_{t-j} + \varepsilon_t$
- $\Delta LHGDP_{t} = C_{2} + \sum_{i_{1}=1}^{l_{1}} \tau_{2_{i}} \Delta LHGDP_{t-i_{1}} + \sum_{i_{2}=1}^{l_{2}} \delta_{1_{i}} \Delta LEXPAT_{t-i_{1}} + \sum_{i_{3}=1}^{l_{3}} \delta_{2_{i}} \Delta LGEXP_{t-i_{2}} + \sum_{i_{4}=1}^{l_{4}} \alpha_{3_{i}} \Delta LGREV_{t-i_{3}} + \lambda_{2} LNHGDP_{t-j} + \theta_{1} LEXPAT_{t-j} + \theta_{2} LGEXP_{t-j} + \beta_{3} LGREV_{t-j} + \varepsilon_{t}$
- $\Delta LNHGDP_{t} = C_{3} + \sum_{i_{1}=1}^{l_{1}} \tau_{3_{i}} \Delta LNHGDP_{t-i_{1}} + \sum_{i_{2}=1}^{l_{2}} \vartheta_{1_{i}} \Delta LEXPAT_{t-i_{1}} + \sum_{i_{3}=1}^{l_{3}} \vartheta_{2_{i}} \Delta LGEXP_{t-i_{2}} + \sum_{i_{4}=1}^{l_{4}} \alpha_{3_{i}} \Delta LGREV_{t-i_{3}} + \lambda_{3}LNHGDP_{t-j} + \mu_{1}LEXPAT_{t-j} + \mu_{2}LGEXP_{t-j} + \beta_{3}LGREV_{t-j} + \varepsilon_{t}$

Diagnostic Tests

- The results from conducting the Skewness, Kurtosis, and Jarque-Bera normality test reveal a normal distribution of the time series variables.
- The findings of ordinary bilateral correlation between variables indicate expected relationship between variables and are statistically significant.
- Stochastic properties of variables were tested using ADF unit root test. All variables except real GDP are I(0) and real GDP is I(1), with intercept and linear trend.

Dependent	Variables	GDP	HGDP	NHGDP		
Horizon	Independent Variables	Coef. & Significance				
	EXPAT	-0.041**	-0.068**	-0.038		
SR	SEXPAT	-0.059**	-0.094	0.003		
	USEXPAT	-0.143**	-0.063	-0.035		
	EXPAT	0.122**	0.059	0.207**		
LR	SEXPAT	0.164**	0.061	0.126		
	USEXPAT	0.114**	0.052**	0.194**		

Dependent V	ariables	EXPAT	SEXPAT	USEXPAT		
Horizon	Independent Variables	Coef. & Significance				
	GDP	1.676	-0.047	1.943		
SR	HGDP	-5.238	-2.979*	-5.491		
	NHGDP	-4.109	0.449	-4.970		
	GDP	1.510	-	1.680		
LR	HGDP	-4.855*	-4.838	-4.978*		
	NHGDP	2.766***	-	2.813***		

- The number of *Expats*, at aggregated and disaggregated levels, is cointegrated with the total *GDP*, and in the <u>short and long terms</u>. (SR - and LR +)
- Unskilled Expats is cointegrated with GDP at aggregated and disaggregated levels, in the long term.
- Bidirectional cointegration between NonHydrocarbon GDP and Unskilled Expats, in the long term.

- ➤ A 10% increase in the number of expatriates correlates with a 1.21% increase in GDP and a 2.07% increase in NHGDP.
- A 10% increase in the number of <u>skilled</u> expatriate labor correlates with a 1.64% increase in GDP.
- ➤ A 10% increase in the volume of <u>unskilled</u> expatriate labor correlates with a 1.14% and a 1.94% rise in GDP and NHGDP.
- A 10% increase in NHGDP is correlated with a 27.7% growth in the total volume of expatriate labor, and specifically a 28.1% growth in the volume of <u>unskilled</u> expatriate labor.

Panel A: GDP									
<u>Variables</u>	Short-Run causality (F-stats) Variables		Short-Run causality (F-stats)Direction of causalityLong-run causalityShort-Run causality (F-stats)200		<u>Long-run</u> <u>causality</u> (ECT t- stats)	Joint Short &	Direction of causality		
	$\Delta LGDP$	ΔLEXPAT	$\Delta LGEXP$			$\begin{array}{c} \Delta LGDP \ \& \\ ECT \end{array}$	ΔLEXPAT & ECT	ΔLGEXP & ECT	
$\Delta LGDP$	-	1.77	0.09	-	-0.4793193*	-	11.45*	16.12*	
$\Delta LEXPAT$	0.73	-	1.51	-	<mark>5.979153***</mark>	2.89	-	2.89	$EXPAT \rightarrow GDP;$ $GEXP \rightarrow GDP$
$\Delta LGEXP$	0.95	1.97	-	-	0.597295	0.99	2.98	-	
Panel B: HGDP									
Variables	Short-Run causality (F-stats)		2	<u>Direction of</u> <u>causality</u>	Long-run causality (ECT t- stats)	<u>Joint Short & Long-run Causality (F- stats)</u>		<u>Direction of</u> <u>causality</u>	
	$\Delta LHGDP$	ΔLEXPAT	$\Delta LGEXP$			ΔLHGDP & ECT	ΔLEXPAT & ECT	ΔLGEXP & ECT	
$\Delta LHGDP$	-	0.18	0.10	-	-0.5094085**	-	8.19**	7.02**	
$\Delta LEXPAT$	0.68	-	0.00	-	0.4968187	0.85	-	0.05	$EXPAT \rightarrow HGDP;$ $GEXP \rightarrow HGDP$
$\Delta LGEXP$	1.36	4.10**	-	$EXPAT \rightarrow GEXP;$	0.6040196	1.70	4.14	-	
Panel C: NHGDP					•	•			
Variables	Short-Run causality (F-stats)		Short-Run causality (F-stats)Direction of causality		Long-run <u>causality</u> (ECT t- stats)	Joint Short &	Long-run Causali	t <u>y (F- stats)</u>	<u>Direction of</u> <u>causality</u>
	$\Delta LNHGDP$	$\Delta LEXPAT$	$\Delta LGEXP$			ΔLNHGDP & ECT	ΔLEXPAT & ECT	ΔLGEXP & ECT	
ΔLNHGDP	-	3.17***	5.56**	$\begin{array}{c} \underline{EXPAT} \rightarrow \\ NHGDP; \ \underline{GEXP} \rightarrow \\ NHGDP; \end{array}$	0.1507593	-	3.56	5.60***	$GEXP \rightarrow NHGDP;$
ΔLEXPAT	8.30*	-	4.29**	$\begin{array}{c} NHGDP \rightarrow \\ EXPAT; \ GEXP \rightarrow \\ EXPAT; \end{array}$	5.571415*	34.26*	-	29.73*	$\begin{array}{c} NHGDP \rightarrow EXPAT;\\ GEXP \rightarrow EXPAT;\\ -\end{array}$
$\Delta LGEXP$	2.01	2.37	-	-	0.4583322	2.65	2.82	-	

	Short-Run causality (F-stats)			Direction of	Long-run causality	Joint Short & 1	Long-run Causality		
<u>Variables</u>	$\Delta LGDP$	∆LEXPAT _SKILL	ΔLG EXP	<u>causality</u>	<u>(ECT t-</u> stats)	ΔLGDP & ECT	ΔLEXPAT_S KILL & ECT	ΔLGEXP & ECT	Direction of causality
$\Delta LGDP$	-	0.01	0.60	-	-0.4391864*	-	15.08*	16.96*	
ΔLEXPAT_S KILL	0.34	-	0.05	-	-1.007049	0.35	-	0.25	$EXPAT_SKILL \to GDP; GEXP \\ \to GDP;$
$\Delta LGEXP$	0.04	0.63	-	-	-0.6985849	1.16	4.05	-	
Panel B:									•
	Short-Run ca	usality (F-stats)		Direction of	Long-run	Joint Short & 1	Long-run Causality ((F-stats)	
<u>Variables</u>	$\Delta LHGDP$	∆LEXPAT _SKILL	ΔLG EXP	<u>causality</u>	<u>(ECT t-</u> stats)	ΔLHGDP & ECT	ΔLEXPAT_S KILL & ECT	ΔLGEXP & ECT	Direction of causality
$\Delta LHGDP$	-	0.25	0.29	-	-0.4227386	-	3.79	3.02	
ΔLEXPAT_S KILL	1.97	-	0.27	-	-1.713525	2.93	-	1.000	$EXPAT_SKILL \rightarrow GEXP;$
$\Delta L GEXP$	1.42	4.21**	-	$\begin{array}{l} EXPAT_SKILL \\ \rightarrow GEXP; \end{array}$	0.0077559	1.42	4.72***	-	
Panel C:									
	<u>Short-Run ca</u>	usality (F-stats)		Direction of	Long-run causality	Joint Short & Long-run Causality (F-stats)			
<u>Variables</u>	$\Delta LNHGD P$	∆LEXPAT _SKILL	ΔLG EXP	<u>causality</u>	<u>(ECT t-</u> stats)	ΔLNHGDP & ECT	ΔLEXPAT_S KILL & ECT	ΔLGEXP & ECT	Direction of causality
ΔLNHGDP	-	9.58*	1.50	$\begin{array}{l} EXPAT_SKILL \\ \rightarrow NHGDP; \end{array}$	-0.1360916*	-	17.65*	18.72*	$EXPAT_SKILL \rightarrow NHGDP; GEXP$
ΔLEXPAT_S KILL	0.46	-	2	-	-1.077505**	6.62**	-	4.72***	$ \overrightarrow{O} NHODI, $ $ NHGDP \rightarrow EXPAT_SKILL; $ $ GEXP \rightarrow EXPAT_SKILL; $
$\Delta LGEXP$	1.14	1.82	-	-	0.1028983	1.14	2.04	-	

Panel A:									
	Short-Run	causality (F-stats)				Joint Short & Long	stats)	Direction of	
<u>Variables</u>		∆LEXPAT_U		Direction of causality	Long-run causality (ECT	Δ	LEXPAT_US ΔLG	EXP &	causality
	ΔLGDP	SKILL	ΔLGEXP		<u>t-stats)</u>	$\Delta LGDP \& ECT$	KILL & ECT	ECT	
ΔLGDP	-	1.63	0.02	-	-0.4560265*	-	10.26*	14.86*	
∆LEXPAT_U		_					_		$EXPAT_USKILL \rightarrow$
SKILL	0.86		1.77	-	6.747977***	3.66		3.65	$GDP; GEXP \rightarrow GDP;$
ΔLGEXP	1.07	2.33	-	-	0.7283849	1.22	3.18	-	
Panel B:						-			
	Short-Run	causality (F-stats)				Joint Short & Long	g-run Causality (F-	stats)	Direction of
<u>Variables</u>		∆LEXPAT_U		Direction of causality	Long-run causality (ECT	Δ	LEXPAT_US ΔLG	SEXP &	causality
	ΔLHGDP	SKILL	ΔLGEXP		<u>t-stats)</u>	$\Delta LHGDP \& ECT$	KILL & ECT	ECT	
ΔLHGDP	-	0.20	0.06	-	-0.4953654**	-	7.89**	6.74**	
∆LEXPAT_U		-					-		
SKILL	0.58		0.00	-	0.4889008	0.74		0.05	$EXPAT_USKILL \rightarrow$
	1.20	4 00 * *	-	$EXPAT_USKILL \rightarrow$	0.0504040	1.0	4.40	-	HGDP; GEXP \rightarrow
ALGEXP	1.39	4.09**		GEXP;	0.6504918	1.8	4.18		HGDP;
Panel C:	1					Γ			
	Short-Run	causality (F-stats)				Joint Short & Long-run Causality (F-stats)		<u>stats)</u>	Direction of
Variables		$\Delta LEXPAT_U$		Direction of causality	Long-run causality (ECT	ΔLNHGDP &	$\Delta LEXPAT_US$	ΔLGEXP &	causality
	ΔLNHGDP	SKILL	ΔLGEXP		<u>t-stats)</u>	ECT	KILL & ECT	ECI	
				EXPAT_USKILL→					
	-	7 87 ***	5 7/**	NHGDP; GEXP → NHGDP:	0 1/1375/	-	3 20	5 20***	$GEXP \rightarrow NHGDP$
ALNHODF		2.82	J.24	NHODE,	0.1413734		5.20	5.25	$\frac{\partial EX}{\partial F} \rightarrow \frac{\partial F}{\partial F}$
				NHGDP \rightarrow					EXPAT_USKILL; GEXP
ΔΙΕΧΡΑΤ U		-		EXPAT_USKILL; GEXP			-		\rightarrow EXPAT_USKILL;
SKILL	7.86*		4.14**	\rightarrow EXPAT_USKILL;	5.905024*	36.55*		32.06*	
				$EXPAT_USKILL \rightarrow GEXP;$					
ΔLGEXP	2.15	2.96***	-		0.5445849	3.2	3.31	-	







Joint



Causality











- Chicken-Egg relationship is found between *Expats* and *NonHydrocarbon GDP* in the <u>short term</u>; and
- between *Skilled Expats* and *NonHydrocarbon GDP*, in the joint term.
- The number of *Expats* has a granger causality with *GDP* at some aggregated and disaggregated levels, in the <u>long term.</u>
- Skilled Expats granger causes NonHydrocarbon GDP, in all terms.
 Unskilled Expats granger causes Hydrocarbon GDP, in all terms.
- NonHydrocarbon GDP has a granger causality with Unskilled Expats in the short and joint term, and with total Expats in the joint term.

- Foreign Labor in Oman plays a significant role in the economic growth, and not visa versa.
 - ✓ NonHydrocarbon sector growth could lead to a higher demand for foreign labor.
- Foreign Labor in Oman has more remarkable linkage with NonHydrocarbon sector than the Hydrocarbon sector. (Skilled & Unskilled Expats)
- Relationships are negative in the shot term due to adjustment to a new country and productivity reasons.
- Findings provide a guide to policymakers in Oman and the GCC countries on labor market correlations and dynamics so as to initiate effective labor market reforms and promote jobs for nationals.

Conclusion

Several policies to address the economic and social challenges:

- **1. Developing a skilled local workforce:** investing in quality education and training programs, financial assistance, incentives to private sector. (targeted sectors)
- 2. Increasing labor market participation of women: underrepresented in the labor force; promoting gender equality.
- 3. Encouraging private sector growth: creating more jobs for locals, reducing! the dependence on foreign labor → by reducing barriers to entry, providing incentives, one-stop shop for business registration and licensing.
- 4. Implementing labor market reforms: reducing the sponsorship system and improving working conditions for workers \rightarrow improving the welfare of workers.
- **5. Promoting entrepreneurship**: create job opportunities for locals, access to financing, supporting business incubators and accelerators, promoting innovation and R&D.



Acknowledgment

- The study has been awarded QUWA research award at the Fourth Forum for Women in Research 2023 entitled "Quwa: Sustaining Women's Empowerment in Research & Innovation" at the the University of Sharjah and the University of Khorfakkan.
- This research work was supported by Abu Dhabi National Oil Company (ADNOC), Emirates NBD, Sharjah Electricity Water & Gas Authority (SEWA), Technology Innovation Institute (TII) and GSK as the sponsors of the 4th Forum for Women in Research (QUWA): Sustaining Women's Empowerment in Research & Innovation at University of Sharjah.



Thank You



Sep 2023 Analysis and Economic Modelling Department

Central Bank of Oman, Muscat, Oman

Summary of results for the 27 models

Model #	Dependent Variable	Independent Variables	Timeline	Effect
Model 1	GDP	Total Expatriate Labor, Government Expenditure	Short term	-ve
Widdel I			Long term	+ve
Model 2		Total Expatriate Labor, Covernment Expenditure	Short term	insignificant
woder z	HGDP	Total Expatriate Labor, Government Experiorture	Long term	insignificant
Model 3	NHGDP	Total Expatriate Labor, Government Expenditure	Short term	insignificant
			Long term	+ve
Model 4	GDP	Skilled Expatriate Labor, Government Expenditure	Short term	-ve
			Long term	+ve
Model 5	HGDR	Skilled Expetripte Labor Government Expenditure	Short term	insignificant
Wodel 5	ngdp Skilled Expatriate Labor, Government Experiature		Long term	insignificant
Model 6	NHGDP	Skilled Expatriate Labor, Government Expenditure	Short term	insignificant
			Long term	+ve
Model 7	GDP	Unskilled Expatriate Labor, Government Expenditure	Short term	-ve
			Long term	+ve
		Unskilled Expertieste Labor Government Expenditure	Short term	insignificant
Wodel 8	HGDP	onskilled Expathate Labor, Government Experiature	Long term	insignificant
Model 9	NHGDP	Unskilled Expatriate Labor, Government Expenditure	Short term	insignificant
			Long term	+ve

Model #	Dependent Variable	Independent Variables	Timeline	Effect
Madal 10	Total Expatriate	Total CDR Covernment Expanditure	Short term	insignificant
WOUEI IO	Labor	Total GDP, Government Expenditure	Long term	insignificant
Model 11	Total Expatriate	Hydrocarbon GDP Government Expenditure	Short term	insignificant
Woder II	Labor		Long term	+ve
Model 12	Total Expatriate	Non-Hydrocarbon GDP Government Expenditure	Short term	insignificant
	Labor	Non Hydrocarbon Obr, Government Experiature	Long term	+ve
Model 13	Skilled Expatriate	Total CDR Covernment Expanditure	Short term	insignificant
WOULD IS	Labor	Total GDP, Government Expenditure	Long term	insignificant
Model 14	Skilled Expatriate	Hydrocarbon GDP Government Expenditure	Short term	insignificant
Widdel 14	Labor	Hydrocarbon GDT, Government Expenditure	Long term	+ve
Madal 15	Skilled Expatriate	Non Hydrocarbon CDD Covernment Evnenditure	Short term	insignificant
WIDGET 15	Labor	Non-frydrocarbon GDP, Government Expenditure	Long term	insignificant
Madal 1C	Unskilled	Total CDD Covernment Evenerality	Short term	insignificant
iviodei 16	Expatriate Labor	Total GDP, Government Expenditure	Long term	insignificant
Model 17	Unskilled	Hydrocarbon GDP Government Expenditure	Short term	insignificant
Widdel 17	Expatriate Labor	Trydrocarbon GDT, Government Expenditure	Long term	+ve
Model 18	Unskilled	Non-Hydrocarbon GDP Government Expenditure	Short term	insignificant
	Expatriate Labor	Non Hydrocarbon Obr, Government Experiature	Long term	+ve

Model #	Dependent Variable	Independent Variables	Timeline	Effect
Medel 10	Government	Total CDD Expatriate Labor	Short term	insignificant
iviodel 19	Expenditure	Total GDP, Expatriate Labor	Long term	insignificant
Model 20	Government	Hydrocarbon CDD Expatriate Labor	Short term	insignificant
iviodei 20	Expenditure	Hydrocarbon GDP, Expathate Labor	Long term	insignificant
Model 21	Government	Non Hydrocarbon CDP Expatriate Labor	Short term	insignificant
INIOUEI 21	Expenditure		Long term	insignificant
Model 22	Government	Total GDP Skilled Expatriate Labor	Short term	insignificant
WOUEI 22	Expenditure	Total GDP, Skilled Expatriate Labor	Long term	insignificant
Madal 22	Government	Hydrocarbon GDP Skilled Expatriate Labor	Short term	insignificant
WOUEI 25	Expenditure	Trydrocarbon GDP, Skilled Expatriate Labor	Long term	insignificant
Model 24	Government		Short term	insignificant
Widdel 24	Expenditure	Non-riyurocarborr ODF, Skilleu Expatriate Labor	Long term	insignificant
Model 25	Government	Total GDP Unskilled Expatriate Labor	Short term	insignificant
Widdel 25	Expenditure	Total ODF, Offskilled Expatiliate Labor	Long term	insignificant
Model 26	Government	Hydrocarbon GDP Unskilled Expatriate Labor	Short term	insignificant
	Expenditure	Trydrocarbon GDP, Offskilled Expatriate Labor	Long term	insignificant
Model 27	Government	Non-Hydrocarbon CDP Unskilled Expatriate Labor	Short term	insignificant
WIDGET 27	Expenditure	Non-rivulocarbon GDF, Onskileu Expande Labor	Long term	insignificant